Championing Equity: Building Professional Learning Programs for Cultural Inclusivity

Tina M. Jordan, Assistant Vice President, Strategic Success Initiatives
Bridget Parsh, Professor of Nursing
Lynn M. Tashiro, Professor of Physics, Director Center for Teaching and Learning
Jazmin Campos, First Year Experience Programs, Coordinator

October 6, 2019
Workshop Overview

I. Professional Learning Programs
   • Nuts and bolts: logistics, budget, schedule, recruitment
   • Theoretical frameworks – Content, Pedagogy, and Assessment

II. Experiential Learning Activities
   • Intercultural Competence learning for student leaders
   • Equity and Inclusion case studies for faculty and program directors
   • Professional Community of Inquiry technology for the campus collective
Professional Learning Program

Types of programs:
• Faculty Learning Communities
• Professional Learning Communities
• Professional Communities of Inquiry

Paradigm Shift
Isolated Learning
Training
Siloed and specialized
Knowledge as narrow expertise
Incremental Change

Collaborative sense making
Intellectual Engagement
Cross functional and holistic
Knowledge embedded in social context
Systemic Change

Theory and Best Practice
• Learning Communities Journal: http://celt.miamioh.edu/lcj/
• Milton Cox (2004, 2018) Faculty Learning Communities
Professional Learning Communities

Nuts and Bolts: Logistics

- Backward Designed Seminar
- Measurable outcomes and work products
- Scaffolded assignments
- Archived deliverables in a learning management system (Canvas)
- 1 year, 10 meetings, 2 hours each, public dissemination of project
- Average Cost: $15,000 - $10,000 faculty stipends, $5,000 facilitation cost

1 Year Timeline

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Structured Curriculum</th>
<th>Indep. Work</th>
<th>Collaborative Work</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>First 5 Meetings:</strong></td>
<td><strong>Summer or Winter Break</strong></td>
<td><strong>Second 5 meetings</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Team and trust building</td>
<td>• Independent work time</td>
<td>• Project or research implementation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Experiential learning activities</td>
<td>• Consultation</td>
<td>• Trouble shooting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Action research or course redesign</td>
<td></td>
<td>• Participant presentations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>project plan</td>
<td></td>
<td>• Dissemination and publication of projects</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Sample Equity Learning Communities

- Program Assessment: Critical Thinking and Global Perspectives
- Equity, Learning, and Student Success Analytics
- Equity, Peer Programs, and Student Success
- Inclusive Teaching for Diverse Learners
- Empowering Student Leaders
- Equity and the Scholarship of Teaching and Learning
- Peer Programs: Collaboration for Equity
- Data Analytics: Scaling for Equity and Impact
Guiding Theoretical Frameworks

Association of American Colleges and Universities: VALUE Rubrics

Bennett’s (2004) Developmental Model of Intercultural Sensitivity

Deardorff’s (2004) Model of Intercultural Competence
Theoretical Frameworks

AACU Rubric - Aligned with University Baccalaureate Learning Goals

Intercultural Knowledge and Competence VALUE Rubric

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CAPSTONE</th>
<th>MILESTONE 1</th>
<th>MILESTONE 2</th>
<th>BENCHMARK</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Knowledge</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Culture Shift Awareness</td>
<td>Anticipates insights into own cultural rules and biases (e.g., teaching complexity, extent of how concepts have shaped these rules, and how to integrate and respond to cultural biases, resulting as a shift in self-description.)</td>
<td>Recognizes new perspectives about own cultural rules and biases (e.g., not looking for sameness, comfortable with the complexity that new perspectives offer.)</td>
<td>Identifies own cultural rules and biases (e.g., with a strong performance for those rules shared with other cultural group and seeks the same as others.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knowledge</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Knowledge of Cultural Variations Frameworks</td>
<td>Demonstrates sophisticated understanding of the complexity of elements important in members of another culture in relation to its history, values, politics, communication styles, economics, or beliefs &amp; practices.</td>
<td>Demonstrates adequate understanding of the complexity of elements important in members of another culture in relation to its history, values, politics, communication styles, economics, or beliefs &amp; practices.</td>
<td>Demonstrates partial understanding of the complexity of elements important in members of another culture in relation to its history, values, politics, communication styles, economics, or beliefs &amp; practices.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skills</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Empathy</td>
<td>Interprets intercultural experience from the perspective of others and more than one worldview and demonstrates ability to act as a responsive audience that appreciates the feelings of another cultural group.</td>
<td>Recognizes intellectual and emotional dimensions of more than one worldview and sometimes uses more than one worldview in interactions.</td>
<td>Identifies components of other cultural perspectives but responds in all situations with own worldview.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skills</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Verbal and non-verbal communication</td>
<td>Anticipates a complex understanding of cultural differences in verbal and nonverbal communication and language.</td>
<td>Recognizes participants in cultural differences in verbal and nonverbal communication and language.</td>
<td>Identifies cultural differences in verbal and nonverbal communication and is aware that</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Framing Language

The call to integrate intercultural knowledge and competence into the heart of education is an imperative born of seeing ourselves as members of a world community, knowing that we share the future with others. Beyond mere exposure to culturally different others, the campus community requires the capacity to: meaningfully engage those others, place social justice in historical and political context, and put culture at the core of transformative learning. The intercultural knowledge and competence rubric suggests a systematic way to measure our capacity to identify our own cultural patterns, compare and contrast them with others, and adapt empathically and flexibly to unfamiliar ways of being.

Attitudes | Concord |
---|---|
Attitudes | Opposition |

The levels of this rubric are informed in part by M. Bennett’s Developmental Model of Intercultural Sensitivity (Bennett, M.J. (1993)). Towards Ethnoestratification: A Developmental Model of Intercultural Sensitivity”. In R. M. Paige (Ed.) Education for the Intercultural Experience (pp. 22-71). Yarmouth, ME: Intercultural Press). In addition, the criteria in this rubric are informed in part by D.K. Deardorff’s intercultural framework which is the first research-based consensus model of intercultural competence (Deardorff, D.K. 2005). “The identification and assessment of intercultural competence as a student outcome of internationalization” in Journal of Studies in International Education, Vol. 10, No. 3, 241-266). It is also important to understand that intercultural knowledge and competence are more complex than what is reflected in this rubric. This rubric identifies six of the key components of intercultural knowledge and competence, but there are other components as identified in the Deardorff model and in other research.

Framed by Bennett’s and Deardorff’s work...
Theoretical Frameworks

Bennett’s (2004) Developmental Model of Intercultural Sensitivity

Denial – complete denial of different ways of human existence.
Defense – Recognition of others but hostility and negative feelings towards them
Minimization – the existence of the others is tolerated, by minimizing the differences between groups
Acceptance – acceptance of the others by respecting differences in behavior
Adaptation – full respect and empathy with others and adaptation of personal behavior
Integration – absorbing and integrating some aspects of behavior and values of others
MIND-SET: “I don’t see race, I am color-blind.”

Minimization of Difference
Deardorff’s (2004) Model of Intercultural Competence

**Desired External Outcome:**
Behaving and communicating effectively and appropriately (based on one’s intercultural knowledge, skills, and attitudes) to achieve one’s goals to some degree.

**Desired Internal Outcome:**
- Adaptability (to different communication styles and behaviors; adjustment to new cultural environments)
- Flexibility (selecting and using appropriate communication styles and behaviors; cognitive flexibility)
- Ethnorelative view
- Empathy

**Knowledge & Comprehension:**
- Cultural self-awareness
- Deep understanding and knowledge of culture (including contexts, role, and impact of culture & others’ worldviews)
- Culture-specific information
- Sociolinguistic awareness

**Skills:**
- To listen, observe, and interpret
- To analyze, evaluate, and relate

**Requisite Attitudes:**
- Respect (valuing other cultures, cultural diversity)
- Openness (to intercultural learning and to people from other cultures, withholding judgment)
- Curiosity and discovery (tolerating ambiguity and uncertainty)

- Move from personal level (attitude) to interpersonal/interactive level (outcomes)
- Degree of intercultural competence depends on acquired degree of underlying elements

How do we develop these skills?

- Practiced Dialogue
- Change in behavior
- Encourage learners to generate thought
- Provoking questions
Putting Theory into Practice
Experiential Learning Activities

Community Agreements

- Active listening
- Vegas Rules – what is said in the community stays in the community
- Respond to and challenge ideas, not people
- Step up, step back, and be aware of space
- Brave Space
  - lean into discomfort; assume good intentions;
  - take responsibility for impact
Experiential Learning Activity 1
“The Form”

Context of Activity:
- Part of the Intercultural Competence learning for student leaders (HSI Peer Network PLC)
- Audience: Faculty, staff, and administrators that direct student peer programs, advising, mentoring tutoring, etc.
- Purpose: To establish equity and inclusion training in student peer programs
- Each program director takes turns opening the PLC session with an intercultural competence activity.
- Participants engaged in a level 1 activity from “Building Cultural Competence: Innovative Activities and Models” - “The Form” pg. 81
Experiential Learning Activity 1
“The Form”

Directions: You have 2 minutes to complete this form
The Form Activity

Debriefing the Activity

1. What one word describes how you felt during this activity, especially in the very beginning?
2. Why do you think the facilitator kept calling out the time? How important is time in some cultures?
3. What strategies did you use to try to complete this form?
4. Were there items on it that did or did not make sense to you?

Thinking about the Models:

A. What stages in the developmental model were experienced as you did this activity?
B. What intercultural attitude, knowledge, skills did you use/practice during this activity?
Experiential Learning Activity 2

Context of Activity:
• HSI Data Analytics and Equity PLC Case Studies
• Audience: Faculty, student affairs staff, and administrators
• Purpose: To examine equity in the context of teaching and learning
• Participants practice discussing equity and applying theoretical models to teaching and learning situations
Experiential Learning Activity 2

Think Pair Share

1. Choose one of the case studies
2. Read through it and take a few notes on your individual thinking
3. Turn to your neighbor and share your answers to the questions

Professional Learning Community
Case Studies for Discussion

Case Study 1: Math
Two math professors are having a conversation after submitting their end of semester grades for Math 300, a gateway course for science majors. The following dialog takes place:

Professor A: "I had a tough semester, the students seemed to get less and less prepared each year, there were a lot of low grades this term."
Professor B: "I know, grading math is subjective and inconsistent, as we know we are all grading about the same way, I can't imagine how departments like business and psychology do it. Grades must vary a lot in those kinds of courses."

After the Math 300 final exam, two students walking to the parking lot have the following conversation:

Second Year Student: How did it go?
Freshman Student: I don't know, it was longer than I thought it was going to be.
Second Year Student: Who did you take it with?
Freshman Student: Professor A.
Second Year Student: What? I told you not to take it! You'll never get an "A" that way.
Freshman Student: Yeah, they say that, but you gotta know the system if you want to get that "A".

Questions:
A. From your perspective, do you in general agree with Professor B's last comment or the Second Year Student's? What evidence do you have to support your position?
B. What stages in the developmental model were experienced as you did this activity?
C. What knowledge and/or skills might the faculty need to confirm or disprove their assertions?
D. What skills might students need to navigate and succeed in the "system"?

Case Study 2: Social Science
A white woman social science professor is teaching a general education course on "Society and Aging," One of the assignments is to visit a Memory Care Facility to observe and document the programs, activities, and healthcare attended by the facility residents. This activity is central to a discussion of how society serves an aging population. She has anticipated that some students will have a difficult time getting to the specific Memory Care facility that she works with, which requires transportation by car. So when she hands out the assignment she announces that students may visit any Memory Care facility in their neighborhood to do the assignment.

There are always a group of students who don't want to do the visit and observation because it is "uncomfortable... creepy... too much work." The professor has heard these comments from previous students in the course, but feels that this activity is critical to the content she is teaching. She has responded to rewriting the assignment to provide greater context to the assignment, however in her last set of student evaluations a student writes, "This assignment is racist and you are a racist." The comment takes her totally by surprise and she is now sitting in your office, upset, and tells you how many times she has revised the assignment and how some students are not just mean with their feedback.

Questions:
1. From your position in higher education, what do you infer might be going on?
2. What skills and knowledge might be needed by the faculty and the student to improve their ability to teach and learn?
Case Study 2: Social Science

A white woman social science professor is teaching a general education course on “Society and Aging”. One of the assignments is to visit a Memory Care Facility to observe and document the programs, activities, and health care provided to the facility residents. This activity is central to a discussion of how society serves an aging population. She has anticipated that some students will have a difficult time getting to the specific Memory Care Facility that she works with, which requires transportation by car. So when she hands out the assignment she announces that students may visit any Memory Care Facility in their neighborhood to do the assignment.

There are always a group of students who don’t want to do the visit and observation because it is “uncomfortable,... creepy... too much work”. The professor has heard these comments from previous students in the course, but feels that this activity is critical to the content she is teaching. She has responded to rewriting the assignment to provide greater context to the assignment, however in her last set of student evaluations a student writes, “this assignment is racist and you are a racist”. The comment takes her totally by surprise and she is now sitting in your office, upset, and tells you how many times she has revised the assignment and how some students are just mean with their feedback.

Questions:

1. From your position in higher education, what do you infer might be going on?
2. What skills and knowledge might be needed by the faculty and the student to improve their ability to teach and learn?
Experiential Learning Activity 2
Share

Case Study 1: Math
A. Do you agree with Professor or the Second Year Student?
B. What stages in the developmental model were experienced as you did this activity?
C. What knowledge and/or skills might the faculty need to confirm or disprove their assertions?
D. What skills might students need to navigate and succeed in the system?

Case Study 2: Social Science
1. What stages in the developmental model were experienced as you did this activity?
2. What skills and knowledge might be needed by the faculty and students to improve teaching and learning
Experiential Learning Activity 3

Professional Community of Inquiry
...a group of professionals involved in a process of empirical or conceptual inquiry into problematic situations.

Logistics:
- One Semester Long
- Recruitment
- Canvas Learning Management System
- Activities
Experiential Learning Activity 3

Examine the list of activities and events to be considered for the PCI.

Goal: select activities and events that support the PCI learning outcome:

Reflect on power and privilege for various cultural groups and hierarchical roles on campus.
Experiential Learning Activity 3

After activities:
- Discussions
- Culminating project and event

Outcomes:
- Spring: 70 participants, 17 equity projects
- Fall: 25 participants
Questions and Comments?

Acknowledgements

Project Funded by:
United States Department of Education: Project INSPIRE DHSI P031S150197
National Science Foundation HIS Project STEMZone DUE 1832335
Association of American Colleges and and Universities
California State University, Office of the Chancellor
California State University Sacramento